

HASAN MUSTAPA

ETHNICITY AND
ISLAM IN
INDONESIA

EDITED BY JULIAN MILLIE



Vernacular Indonesia Series

© Copyright 2017

© Copyright of this collection in its entirety is held by the editor, Julian Millie.

© Copyright of the individual chapters is held by the respective authors.

All rights reserved. Apart from any uses permitted by Australia's Copyright Act 1968, no part of this book may be reproduced by any process without prior written permission from the copyright owners. Inquiries should be directed to the publisher.

Monash University Publishing
Matheson Library and Information Services Building
40 Exhibition Walk
Monash University
Clayton, Victoria 3800, Australia
www.publishing.monash.edu

Monash University Publishing brings to the world publications which advance the best traditions of humane and enlightened thought.

Monash University Publishing titles pass through a rigorous process of independent peer review.

<http://www.publishing.monash.edu/books/hm-9781925495553.html>

Design: Les Thomas

Cover image: Artwork by Kendra H. Paramita, used with permission of TEMPO.

Series: Vernacular Indonesia

Series editor: Julian Millie (Monash University)

Board members:

Emma Baulch (Queensland University of Technology)

R. Michael Feener (University of Oxford)

Zane Goebel (Latrobe University)

Edwin Jurriens (University of Melbourne)

National Library of Australia Cataloguing-in-Publication entry:

Title: Hasan Mustapa : ethnicity and Islam in Indonesia / Julian Millie, editor.

ISBN: 9781925495553 (paperback)

Subjects: Mustapa, Hasan, R., 1852-1930
Sundanese literature--Islamic influences.
Islam--Indonesia--21st century.
Islamic renewal--Indonesia.
Ethnicity--Religious aspects--Islam.
Islam and politics--Indonesia.

Other Creators/Contributors:

Millie, Julian, 1967- editor.

Printed in Australia by Griffin Press an Accredited ISO AS/NZS 14001:2004 Environmental Management System printer.



The paper this book is printed on is certified against the Forest Stewardship Council® Standards. Griffin Press holds FSC chain of custody certification SGS-COC-005088. FSC promotes environmentally responsible, socially beneficial and economically viable management of the world's forests.

CONTENTS

List of illustrations	vii
Foreword	viii

Martin van Bruinessen

Contributors	xviii
Acknowledgements	xxi

Chapter 1

Hasan Mustapa and the Sundanese	1
---------------------------------------	---

Julian Millie

Chapter 2

<i>The Teachings of Our Islamic Inheritance (Gelaran Sasaka di Kaislaman)</i>	<i>25</i>
---	-----------

By Hasan Mustapa, translated from Sundanese

by Julian Millie and Hawé Setiawan

Chapter 3

<i>The Teachings of Our Islamic Inheritance: The drama of the human lifecourse</i>	<i>85</i>
--	-----------

Ahmad Gibson Albustomi

Chapter 4

The doctrine of the Seven Grades in Hasan Mustapa's verse	117
---	-----

Jajang A. Rohmana

Chapter 5

'It is incumbent upon Indonesian Muslims to be loyal to the
Dutch East Indies Government':

A study of a fatwa by Hasan Mustapa 141
Mufti Ali

Chapter Six

Haji Hasan Mustapa: Floating downstream 161
Ajip Rosidi

Chapter Seven

Form and semantics of Mustapa's versification 185
Hawé Setiawan

Chapter Eight

The Solitary Man: Hasan Mustapa's spirituality in the present . . . 203
Asep Salahudin

Chapter Nine

Hasan Mustapa as Sundanese writer 221
Ruhaliab

Chapter Ten

Ethnic Islamic legacies in the Indonesian present 239
Julian Millie

Index 267

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

- Image A. viii
Hasan Mustapa. Image originally published in *Bijdragen tot de
Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde van Nederlandsch-Indië* 101 (1942)
- Image B. 16
Wangsaatmadja (d. 1961) was Mustapa's scribe from 1923 to 1930.
(From the collection of Martin van Bruinessen).
- Image C. 24
A diagrammatic impression of Mustapa's teachings. (Copied by
Martin van Bruinessen from a privately owned original.)
- Image D 235
Codex Or. 7881, stored in the library of Leiden University, contains
a number of works by Mustapa. This folio is the opening of *I have
the consolation of the jewel: Kinanti*.



Image A: Hasan Mustapa

Image originally published in *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde van Nederlandsch-Indië* 101 (1942).

FOREWORD

Martin van Bruinessen

This book is a long overdue tribute to a most remarkable man of letters, religious official, mystic and vernacular ethnographer *avant la lettre*, who has been undeservedly almost forgotten outside his native Priangan. Haji Hasan Mustapa was a towering figure of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century who embodied a rich composite of Islamic scriptural knowledge, Sundanese literary and mystical tradition, and the *adat* or customs of highland West Java. In international academic circles, little is known of him apart from his collaboration with Snouck Hurgronje in Aceh as well as Java or his authorship of a comprehensive inventory, at Snouck's prodding, of Sundanese *adat*. In Indonesia too, he has never received wide recognition of his qualities as an intellectual giant bridging tradition and modernity, *adat* and Islam. This may be due at least in part, as Julian Millie has suggested elsewhere, to his association with Snouck Hurgronje and the Dutch colonial project, but some of Snouck's other associates (Sayyid Usman, Hoesein Djajadiningrat) have not been relegated to similar oblivion. Another factor no doubt is that Hasan Mustapa expressed himself exclusively in Sundanese or Arabic, and that his poetry was most appreciated in Sundanese aristocratic (*menak*) circles, who in Indonesia's Independence struggle supported the Pasundan state rather than the Sukarno-Hatta Republic and have been politically marginalised ever since. Later Sundanese literary figures, most notably Ajip Rosidi, have made efforts to generate a revival of interest in Hasan Mustapa, and among Sundanese intellectuals and

academics there has been an ongoing if minor tradition of engaging with his writing and religious ideas. Broader recognition has not yet been forthcoming, but I venture to suggest that Haji Hasan Mustapa's work is potentially of contemporary relevance. Among the different responses to globalisation and resistance to Westernisation and Arabisation of Indonesian cultures there is a renewed interest in what some have glossed as *Islam Nusantara* (Archipelagic Islam), discourses and practices that are genuinely Muslim as well as authentically Indonesian. Haji Hasan Mustapa was definitely an authoritative and inspiring representative of *Islam Nusantara*.

My own encounter with Haji Hasan Mustapa and his religious ideas took place more than thirty years ago. I was living in Bandung and making efforts to become an anthropologist of Indonesian Islam. My research project was about economic marginalisation and Islamic radicalisation, but I soon became more interested in the various Sufi orders and Sundanese mystical movements in which some of my respondents were involved. Travelling through West Java and spending nights in various Islamic schools and places of pilgrimage, I thought I could discern a distinct Sundanese spirituality, which found expression in esoteric movements and local cults such as *Perjalanan* and *Sunda Wiwitan* but also in formal Muslim religiosity in West Java. A chain of holy graves and other sacred sites, stretching from Pamijahan on the south coast, Cirebon in the northeast and Banten in the west to pilgrimage sites closer to Bandung visited by my respondents, appeared to mirror the gradual penetration and indigenisation of Sufi teachings, mostly associated with the *Syattariyah* Sufi order. The concepts of divine emanation in seven grades of Being (*martabat tujuh*) and of man as an imperfect but perfectible manifestation of divine and prophetic attributes,

FOREWORD

expressed in oblique terms and suggestive diagrams in *Syattari* manuscripts, were embraced by Sufi orders as well as ostensibly non-Islamic esoteric movements. So was the idea that religion has different levels of understanding and obedience, the exoteric level of *syariat* (Ar: *shari'ah*), i.e. formal obligations and literal meanings, and the esoteric level of a higher reality or *hakékat* (Ar: *haqiqah*). The devotional repertoire of Sundanese spirituality includes pilgrimages to holy graves, self-purification in nightly bathing ceremonies, and various exercises to connect with the spiritual forces surrounding us.

The *Darul Islam* (*The Abode of Islam*) movement, which had aimed to establish a state based on the Shariah instead of the secular nationalist ideology of Pancasila, consisted of Islamist hardliners but was at the same time pervaded by this Sundanese spirituality. (I acquired a copy of the diary that had been kept by a *Darul Islam* fighter and was surprised by the mystical-magical worldview it revealed.) The *Darul Islam* was militarily defeated in 1962 but has persisted as a number of loosely connected underground networks, which have remained more closely attached to Sundanese Muslim traditionalism than to the Salafism of other Muslim radicals.

At the time of my research in Bandung, the Sundanese spiritual tradition found perhaps its most prominent embodiments in the *Qadiriyyah wa Naqsyabandiyah* Sufi order and the cult of Abdul Qadir Jailani (which Julian Millie later studied). And, as said, it had many other manifestations: in other Sufi orders, mystical cults, esoteric spirituality groups, and the everyday religiosity of ordinary village and urban neighbourhood communities. The only Muslim group that fiercely rejected this Sundanese spirituality and its devotional practices was the puritan reformist movement *Persis* (*Persatuan Islam*, The Islamic Association). There was a small *Persis* congregation

among my neighbours; their puritan attitude isolated them from the rest of the community, who spoke of them as having broken away from a common cultural heritage.

In fact, one of my key informants, Oemar Soeraatmadja, had in his youth been an active member of *Persis*, but following an encounter with a charismatic mystic teacher, D.S. Roekman, he had a conversion experience, became Roekman's acolyte, and helped him to organise his disciples into a Sufi association, *Paguyuban Mistik Islam Rasa Tunggal* (The Mystical Islamic Collective of the Foremost Feeling), and acted as his exegete, explaining the master's Sundanese mystical teachings in terms of the Sufi tradition. ('In *Rasa Tunggal*, I represent *syariat*, and Roekman *hakékat*,' he said.) Pak Oemar introduced me not only to Roekman but also to several other representatives of the Sundanese spiritual tradition, ranging from orthodox Muslims to self-consciously heterodox *kebatinan* (inner spirituality) followers. Pak Oemar was also, I believe, one of the first to speak to me of Haji Hasan Mustapa and mention that he was praised by the orthodox as well as the heterodox as a man of deep knowledge, an authority of *syariat* as well as *hakékat*.

In one of our first discussions on Sufism and different levels of understanding, Pak Oemar hinted at the deeper meaning of the Muslim creed (*shahadah*) he had begun to grasp thanks to his teacher Roekman: at the *syariat* level, the prophet Muhammad was a historical figure in Mecca, distant from us in time, place and culture, but at the deeper level of *hakékat*, Muhammad is a spiritual entity that we can only know in and through ourselves. The devotions *Rasa Tunggal* taught included interiorising exercises for connecting with the latter True Muhammad. This resonates with well-known concepts of metaphysical Sufism, *wahdat al-wujud* (Unity of Being)

FOREWORD

and *haqiqah Muhammadiyah* (Muhammadan Reality). It is also reminiscent of the well-known anecdote of Haji Hasan Mustapa's challenging and confounding his learned colleagues over the true meaning of the Muslim creed (which is narrated by Julian Millie in the first chapter of this book).

Haji Hasan Mustapa was not interested in having many disciples and followers. Among orthodox Muslims there is no school of thought directly traceable to him. The self-described followers whom I did meet and could interview were older, Dutch educated men, who had been associated with the group *Galih Pakuan* (Heart of Pakuan) and belonged to the heterodox end of the spectrum. Ema Bratakoesoema was a prominent promoter of Sundanese culture and the martial arts – I first met him through my martial arts contacts and later found out that several Sundanese intellectuals owed their higher education to their having been adopted by him. He had also sponsored the recent publication of one of Haji Hasan Mustapa's works, *Gendingan Dangding Sunda Birahi Katut Wirahmana* (1976). Oemar Soeraatmadja, who was his relative, suspected that Ema had tampered with the text to have it conform better to his own project of a not-so-Islamic Sundanese revival. (That was not Oemar's only suspicion: he also believed that Wangsaatmadja, Haji Hasan Mustapa's scribe in the latter part of his life, made his own adaptations and changes in the texts he was dictated and may even have passed off some of his own writing as Mustapa's. Wangsaatmadja had been active in the Theosophical Movement before he met Hasan Mustapa, and Oemar believed some of the later works show an influence of Theosophy.)

Ema Bratakoesoema and Djajasupena, the men from whom I heard most about Haji Hasan Mustapa, told me they had in fact been closer to a follower and close friend of his, Ajengan Bangkonol ('the

religion teacher of Bangkonol'). Bangkonol, whose personal name was Abdul Hafid, had spent many years studying the exoteric and esoteric sciences of the *pesantren* (Islamic boarding school) tradition as an itinerant student in East Java and Madura and was well-versed in Islamic law as well as the invocation of supernatural support in healing and the martial arts. He led a small mosque and *pesantren* in the village of Cibangkonol, to the west of Bandung, and not long after Haji Hasan Mustapa's appointment as the chief Islamic official of Bandung the two men met. Hasan Mustapa questioned Abdul Hafid about the true meaning of the *shahadah* – the question referred to above and in Millie's first chapter. In a sudden flash of enlightenment, Abdul Hafid saw the old certainties on which his life had been based shattered and knew he had to make a radical break. He started behaving very eccentrically – 'like a madman,' Djajasupena said; but the eccentricities resembled those of some other holy men (*wali*) in Java. Abdul Hafid smashed the mosque's *bedug* to pieces (the large wooden drum used for marking the times of prayer) and sent the students in his *pesantren* home. 'He did not want to sell lies anymore,' Djajasupena explained; having grasped the *bakékat* of God's and Muhammad's existence, he no longer cared for the *syariat*. He left his house and wandered about, avoiding human company and spending the nights in a hut in the paddy fields, where he was visited by a mysterious guest from the spirit world. From that time on he would speak in his sleep, or go into a trance when awake and speak words that were only partly intelligible but foretold events that were to happen.

Abdul Hafid later resettled in the city of Bandung, where he remained known by the name of Ajengan Bangkonol, although he had abandoned his village and position as a teacher. He became

FOREWORD

one of Haji Hasan Mustapa's closest friends, as well as father-in-law to Wangsaatmadja, Hasan Mustapa's scribe. Ajengan Bangkonol and Wangsaatmadja, who survived Hasan Mustapa by many years, appear to have had a significant impact on the reception of the latter's ideas in self-consciously syncretistic upper class circles and may have downplayed the orthodox dimension of his religious views.

This was at least what I gathered from a conversation with Wangsaatmadja's youngest son Tjitjih, the only of his children who was seriously interested in Haji Hasan Mustapa's religious thought (and who kept a large though incomplete collection of his works). He told me that his father had come to Bandung from Subang as a schoolteacher in the early 1920s. With his background in Theosophy, he was fascinated when he heard the story of Ajengan Bangkonol's enlightenment and eccentric behaviour. This had in fact been what motivated him to approach Haji Hasan Mustapa and volunteer to become his scribe. He also sought Ajengan Bangkonol's company, gained his confidence and married his daughter, and remained close to him after Hasan Mustapa's death.

I told Tjitjih that I was interested in the genealogy of Sundanese esoteric movements and wondered whether Hasan Mustapa might have been the crucial link connecting the earlier *Syattariyah* Sufi tradition with these movements. Tjitjih strongly objected to this suggestion and insisted that, unlike his own grandfather Ajengan Bangkonol, Haji Hasan Mustapa always firmly remained within the boundaries of orthodox Islam. He was a master in expressing Islamic thought and concepts in the Sundanese language, but he never accommodated Sundanese pre-Islamic ideas in his religious worldview, Tjitjih insisted. He had an intellectual interest in heterodox beliefs and practices and described some in his book on the *adat* of

the Sundanese, but always made his disagreement clear. He never dabbled in magic or recited mantras and formulas to call upon spirits, as Ajengan Bangkonol used to do and Tjitjih himself (like many young Sundanese) did in his youth. Tjitjih clearly felt protective of Haji Hasan Mustapa's legacy and did not want him to be associated with esoteric spirituality; he wanted him to be remembered as a Muslim intellectual. He was convinced that copies of Haji Hasan Mustapa's work that had been deposited in the National Museum were deliberately destroyed, and was concerned lest radical puritans might attempt to wipe out his work altogether.

I never had the chance to become more deeply involved in Hasan Mustapa's work. I never mastered Sundanese language and culture sufficiently to understand his poetry with its rich metaphors, or even the prose texts edited by Wangsaatmadja. Moreover, the vicissitudes of academic life steered my work into another direction. I remained convinced of the importance of Haji Hasan Mustapa's work to understanding the spiritual tradition of Indonesian Islam, and I have always wanted to return to it later in life. It is gratifying to see that his work has now been made more accessible with this important volume. It is the first time that we have now a major work by Hasan Mustapa in English translation, along with some helpful essays on the man and his work.

This book is an important contribution to scholarship about Haji Hasan Mustapa, and Julian Millie is to be congratulated for presenting this interesting figure for the first time to an international audience. He has put together a judiciously chosen set of essays that highlight various aspects of Haji Hasan Mustapa's religious thought and literary production. Pride of place is given, after Millie's introductory chapter, to a key work in Hasan Mustapa's oeuvre, which discusses the mystic

FOREWORD

path in Islam. The translation and annotation of this text alone are major feats. This is followed by an analysis of this work by Hasan Mustapa's leading exegete, Ahmad Gibson Albustomi, and a study of the Sufi doctrine of the seven grades of Being in Hasan Mustapa's poetry by Jajang A. Rohmana. These chapters clearly establish his place as a major representative of metaphysical Sufism embedded in its Indonesian cultural context. Among the other chapters we find a thoughtful essay by Ajip Rosidi, the senior Sundanese literary author and intellectual who has played a major role in reassembling Hasan Mustapa's oeuvre and transmitting his heritage as a man of letters and religious thinker to younger generations. It is good to see this early essay now in English translation.

The remaining chapters deal with various other aspects of Haji Hasan Mustapa's life and work: his attitude towards the colonial government, his attachment to Sundanese culture and his efforts to harmonise Islamic content and Sundanese form, the literary technique and use of various verse forms in his poetry. Together, the chapters of this book also constitute a good overview of the contemporary reception of Hasan Mustapa and his work by Sundanese intellectuals and academics. I have thoroughly enjoyed reading this book and wish it a large readership.

CONTRIBUTORS

Julian Millie

Julian Millie is Associate Professor in the Anthropology program of Monash University. His first book, *Bidasari: Jewel of Malay Muslim Culture*, was a study of Islamic romance in the Malay language. His second, *Splashed by the Saint: Ritual Reading and Islamic Sanctity in West Java*, was based on a period of field research over fourteen months during which he attended an Islamic intercession ritual in West Java. Since then, Millie has continued to work in West Java, focusing mainly on Islamic preaching and the interactions between sub-national and national Islamic spheres.

Ahmad Gibson Albustomi

'Kang Gibson' teaches philosophy of religion in the *Usul al-Din* Faculty at the Sunan Gunung Djati State Islamic University in Bandung. He obtained his PhD in Religious Studies from the same institution. He has been active in the Bandung-based philosophy study group known as the *Yayasan Pasomoan Sophia*, and is an active contributor of articles on Islam and society to various media.

Mufti Ali

A native of Banten, Mufti undertook undergraduate study in the Shariah Faculty of Banten's Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin State Islamic University, where he currently works as lecturer and head of the Centre for Research and Community Service (LPPM). Between 1998 and 2008 he undertook postgraduate studies in the Faculty of Theology at Leiden University, in the Netherlands. In November of 2008 he successfully defended his thesis entitled *Muslim Opposition to Logic and Theology in the Light of the Works of Jalal al-Din al-Suyuti*. From 2007-2015 he was director of the research division of the Centre for the Study of Banten History and Culture (Laboratorium Bantenologi). He has published a number of articles in academic journals.

CONTRIBUTORS

Martin van Bruinessen

Martin van Bruinessen is Emeritus Professor in the Department of Philosophy and Religious Studies at Utrecht University. He carried out his first fieldwork among the Kurds of Iran, Iraq, Turkey and Syria in the mid-1970s. Between 1982 and 1994 he spent altogether nine years in Indonesia, in research and teaching on Islam-related subjects. He has frequently revisited both regions for shorter periods of field research. His most recent, book-length publication on Indonesia is the edited volume *Contemporary Developments in Indonesian Islam: Explaining the 'Conservative Turn'* (ISEAS, 2013), published in Indonesian as *Conservative turn: Islam Indonesia dalam ancaman fundamentalisme* (Mizan, 2014).

Jajang A. Rohmana

Jajang A Rohmana currently lectures at the Sunan Gunung Djati State Islamic University in Bandung. He was awarded his PhD title in 2013 at the same university for his dissertation on Qur'anic exegesis in West Java. In 2015, Jajang received the National Lecturer Achievement Award from the Indonesian Ministry of Religious Affairs. He has published many articles on Sundanese Sufi and Qur'anic studies, including several on Mustapa's works.

Ajip Rosidi

Ajip Rosidi has published many books in Indonesian and Sundanese containing his original poems, essays, short stories and criticism. Throughout his career, this autodidact has been an advocate for Sundanese culture, and has pioneered programmes for the preservation of the sub-national cultures of Indonesia more generally. He has completed many research projects on Sundanese arts, literature and culture, including his massive transcription project of the Sundanese bardic genre, *pantun* (1970s). His monumental body of written work includes the first encyclopedia dedicated to a sub-national Indonesian culture, the *Ensiklopédi Sunda* (2000), and his 1989 volume on Mustapa has opened the door to subsequent academic approaches to the man

HASAN MUSTAPA

and his work. Ajip has won many awards and honours, including two national literary awards for poetry (1955-1956) and prose (1957-1958). In 2011, Ajip was awarded a Doctorate *Honoris Causa* at Padjadjaran University, Bandung. His autobiography, *Hidup Tanpa Ijazah* was published in 2008.

Ruhaliah

Ruhaliah was born in Bogor, West Java, and completed her PhD in 2006 at Padjadjaran University in Bandung, West Java. Her dissertation research involved the philological study of the verse narrative of Amir Hamzah. Included amongst her research experience is a lengthy period working with microfilms of Mustapa's verse works, transliterating them into Roman script. She teaches in the Sundanese Language and Culture program at the Indonesia University of Education, Bandung.

Asép Salahudin

Asép Salahudin earned his PhD degree from Padjadjaran University in Bandung. He now lectures in the Arts and Literature Faculty at Pasundan University, and is Dean of the Shariah Faculty at the Latifah Mubarakiyah Islamic Institute at the Suryalaya religious school in Tasikmalaya, West Java. He regularly contributes articles to local and national newspapers, including the national daily *Kompas*.

Hawé Setiawan

In 2014 Hawé was awarded his PhD degree in the Faculty of Visual Arts at Bandung's Institute of Technology (ITB) for his dissertation entitled *Representation of the 19th Century Priangan Landscape in the illustrations of Franz Wilhelm Junghun*. He now lectures in the Arts and Literature Faculty of Pasundan University in Bandung, and has a weekly column in the newspaper *Pikiran Rakyat*. He is a prolific writer whose writings have appeared in Indonesian, Sundanese and English in a wide range of media and publications.

Chapter 5

‘IT IS INCUMBENT UPON
INDONESIAN MUSLIMS
TO BE LOYAL TO THE
DUTCH EAST INDIES
GOVERNMENT’

A study of a fatwa by Hasan Mustapa

Mufti Ali

[An earlier version of this chapter was published in volume XXVII/2 of *Hamdard Islamicus: The Quarterly Journal of Studies and Research in Islam* (2004), published by the Hamdard Foundation, Pakistan.]

The Muslim scholars appointed to exercise Islamic legal authority under the Dutch colonial government, known as *penghulu* (lit. head person), were confronted with a dilemma. On the one hand, the *penghulu* had to act in accordance with the letter and spirit of his vocation, but on the other he was urged to satisfy the political interests of his ‘employer’. Professionally speaking, the duty of a *penghulu* was that of a *qadi*, an authority responsible for determining facts and passing judgement, as well as that of a *mufti*, the giver of ‘legal’ advice in accordance with the interests of the people, corresponding

HASAN MUSTAPA

to the sense of justice prevailing in the Muslim community.¹ Yet the *penghulu* may sometimes have been compelled to give legal advice against the interests of the people. When he became the Chief *penghulu* in Aceh, Hasan Mustapa compiled a series of questions and answers in which he dealt with, among other things, the question of whether Acehnese who were waging war against the Dutch East Indies soldiers had a duty to be loyal to the Dutch East Indies Government. That compilation, which takes the form of a manuscript stored in Leiden University's Universiteits Bibliotheek (UB) and bears the title *Kashf al-Sara'ir fi Haqiqat Atjeh wa Fidr* (Revelation of the Secrets about the Reality of Aceh and Pidir), is the subject of this chapter.²

This paper clarifies the context that would lead Mustapa to take the position expressed in his *fatwa*. I find that context in Mustapa's loyalty to the Dutch Islamicist and government-adviser Christiaan Snouck Hurgronje (1857-1936). The relationship between these two men, as well as Snouck Hurgronje's deep involvement in Dutch efforts to end the Aceh War, provide the relevant background to understanding Mustapa's *fatwa*.

I commence with an examination of Mustapa's relationship with Snouck Hurgronje, which involves consideration also of the latter's involvement in the Aceh War. There follows a discussion of *The Revelation* and its key features. I extrapolate two answers from the book, which constitute a *fatwa* about the obligation of Acehnese Muslims to support the colonial government. I extend this discussion of the *fatwa* by comparing it with a number of other *fatwa* on the same topic that were circulating at around the same time.

1 For a discussion of the role of the *Penghulu*, see Ismail (1997), and Pijper (1977).

2 The MS bears the identifying number Cod. Or. 7636.

Haji Hasan
Christiaan
studied in
1885, the
studied in
living and
in a letter
friend the
daily act
and their
being dis
among
this visit
Hurgronje
Mecca. In
instantly
Indies as
Adviser
for Ind
returned
Arabic
in the In
Islam in
Mustapa
and beg
In 188
his rese
that jo
1892 M

Haji Hasan Mustapa and Snouck Hurgronje

Christiaan Snouck Hurgronje was a Dutch orientalist who had studied theology and semitic languages in the Netherlands. In 1884-1885, the young Snouck Hurgronje had visited Mecca, where he had studied Meccan society, with special emphasis on the Indies subjects living and studying there. He revealed his intentions in going to Mecca in a letter to Theodor Noldeke dated August 1, 1885, informing his friend that the main goals of his activities in Mecca were to study the daily activity of the pilgrims, as well as the behaviour of the 'ulama' and their political activity concerning the pan-Islamism which was being disseminated in the Muslim world by the pilgrims, especially among Muslims in the East Indies (Koningsveld 1989: 56). During this visit, he most probably met with Hasan Mustapa. Snouck Hurgronje became a Muslim and took on an Islamic name while in Mecca. The two volumes published out of that experience made him instantly famous. After that, he travelled to the Netherlands East Indies and commenced his career as civil servant there, initially as Adviser for Eastern Languages and Islamic Law, and later as Adviser for Indigenous and Arab Affairs. On leaving the Indies in 1906, he returned to the Netherlands and took up a position as Professor of Arabic at Leiden University. His collected writings about Islamic life in the Indies are a valuable source of information about Indies life and Islam in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Mustapa returned from his last period of study in Mecca in 1885, and began to teach various Islamic subjects in the Mosque of Garut. In 1889, he met once more with Snouck Hurgronje, and became his research assistant in his travels through Java. After completing that journey he went back to Garut and resumed his teaching. In 1892 Mustapa was appointed Chief-*penghulu* of Kota Radja (Aceh),

a cultural environment greatly different from his home in the Sundanese lands, on the recommendation of Snouck Hurgronje. His new status as a *penghulu* involved him directly in the affairs of the Dutch colonial government. He was now the official responsible for Islamic religious matters, but was simultaneously performing an unofficial role as informant to Snouck Hurgronje. I will say more about the political background to this appointment below.

Mustapa arrived in Aceh to take up his new position as the Chief *Penghulu* of Kota Radja on February 22, 1893. He held this position for three years. The appointment did not end well. The Governor of Aceh Besar wrote in 1894 that Mustapa was 'biased' and 'not to be trusted', and that he had not been able to derive benefit from Mustapa's talents (Koningsveld 1990: L-LIV). Snouck Hurgronje wrote in defence of Mustapa, pointing out that he had not been well-treated by some of the Europeans in Aceh, and that Mustapa, by virtue of his outsider status, might have posed a threat to the 'deceits and intrigues' being practised by the indigenous officials of Kota Radja. Snouck Hurgronje ended his defence of Mustapa by recommending a similar appointment somewhere else, 'for example in the Priangan' (Koningsveld 1990: LV). Mustapa was appointed as head *penghulu* of Bandung in September of 1895. The appointment in Kota Radja has an important context: the political background of the Aceh War and Snouck Hurgronje's role in that conflict.

Snouck Hurgronje and the Aceh War

Aceh, located on the northern tip of Sumatra, was a sultanate with a long history and proud tradition. In the nineteenth century its exports of pepper and other products were high. Devotion to Islam was high in the Sultanate, and Islamic officials were significant players in political

matters. In
 fierce trans-
 the Dutch
 geographic
 outside pow-
 to maintain
 1871 the
 The Dutch
 ernment
 governmen
 the Dutch
 formed in
 their inter-
 declared
 landed in
 under the
 several
 Kota B.
 later in
 April
 The
 the Dutch
 expenses
 subside
 and
 this
 term

matters. In the London Treaty of 1824, the Dutch and English, fierce trade rivals, undertook to respect Acehese sovereignty, but the Dutch subsequently perceived that an independent Aceh, located geographically within the sphere of Dutch influence, was vulnerable to outside powers.³ As the nineteenth century progressed, English resolve to maintain a free Aceh diminished, and after the Sumatra Treaty of 1871 the Dutch were no longer restrained in making advances on Aceh.

The Dutch sent a number of envoys urging the Acehese government to acknowledge the sovereignty of the Dutch Colonial government. The Acehese rejected the requests and conversely urged the Dutch Colonial government to give back lands that had previously formed parts of Aceh, such as Sibolga, Nias and Langkat. Perceiving their interests in Sumatra to be threatened, the Dutch government declared war on March 26, 1873. On 8 April 1873 the Dutch army landed in Pante Ceureumen, in the eastern region of Ulee Cheue under the command of J.H.R. Kohler. After having waged war for several days, the Dutch were able to hold only the Great Mosque of Kota Radja. Due to the pressure of the Acehese army, however, they later abandoned it. Kohler was shot and the Dutch army left Aceh on April 29, 1873. The first attack had failed (Alfian 1987: 87).

This was the start of the Aceh War. In the decades to follow, the Dutch were to establish civil rule in Aceh, but at the same time expended great human and material resources in an attempt to subdue a population who generally did not support the colonial power and who valued their independence. Religion had much to do with this. The Islamic scholars of the Sultanate saw the war in religious terms: for many Acehese, the war was a 'War against Unbelievers'

3 Sources on the Aceh War include Reid (1969), Veer (1969) and Alfian (1987).

(Acehnese: *perang kaphe*) or a Holy War (Malay/Acehnese: *perang sabil*, lit. war for the way [of Allah]).

The Aceh War attracted a measure of Muslim support from around the world. It is known that under the cover of the pilgrimage weapons were secretly being dispatched to Aceh from Istanbul (Koningsveld 1989: 182). The leaders of the Acehnese rebellion who escaped from Aceh and were sought by the colonial authorities were known to reside in the Holy City of Islam. Mecca became the central city of agitation. Aware of this, Kruyt, the Dutch consul in Jeddah, proposed to the Ministry of Colonies in The Hague the training of local secret Muslim agents who could enter Mecca freely. Since this initiative was rejected by the Ministry of Colonies, he suggested another proposal, namely the dispatching of two envoys among the pilgrims entering Mecca. This proposal was also rejected by the Ministry of Colonies. Finally, Snouck Hurgronje was recommended for dealing with this 'secret duty'.

His experience with the Acehnese community in Mecca helped his subsequent career in the East Indies. From July 1891 to 1892, he resided in Kota Radja, the capital of Aceh Besar district, fulfilling a commission from the Indies government to report on the role of religion in the conflict and to advise on ways to resolve it. He developed relationships with Islamic elites to the point where he could collect valuable information that would enable him to design a colonial policy concerning the centres of religious learning in the East Indies. Snouck Hurgronje's influence on Dutch policy in Aceh was to increase over the following years (Reid 1969: 270-278).

Snouck Hurgronje's involvement in the Dutch struggle in Aceh provides the necessary context for understanding the appointment of Mustapa as *penghulu* in Kotaraja. Mustapa held sufficient qualifications in the Islamic sciences, but more than that, his appointment

offered political advantages for the Dutch. Snouck Hurgronje wrote that Mustapa was reliable and was not a 'radical', and that his status as an outsider – Mustapa was ethnically Sundanese rather than Acehese – could enable a perspective free of the internal interests of the Acehese officials (Koningsveld 1990: LI). Furthermore, Mustapa's credibility was bolstered by the fact that he had not initially been interested in the position, due to the negative implications it might have held for his social status. After some encouragement by Snouck, he finally decided to accept it.

Snouck Hurgronje's mode of work sheds further light on the appointment. As already noted, the Dutchman was highly successful in establishing close relationships with capable Indies Muslims who kept him well-informed about issues connected with Islamic life in the Indies. This was an element of his success as a government adviser. Mustapa appears as one of a number of indigenous Indies subjects who assisted Snouck Hurgronje in his work for the colonial government, both in Arabia and the East Indies. Haji Aboe Bakar Djajadiningrat is often considered Snouck's most loyal assistant, as he supplied most of the information for a large part of Snouck's book *Mecca in the latter part of the nineteenth century* (Koningsveld 1989: 19, 100). He supplied information to the Dutch Consulate in Jeddah about the rebellious leaders from West Java who had escaped and resided in Mecca. Furthermore, he oversaw the activity of Indonesian pilgrims, collecting information about them and secretly tracking the activities of the rebels from the East Indies. In a letter sent to Euting, the Strasbourg Orientalist, on December 11, 1888, Snouck wrote about his next journey to the East Indies: 'In Suez, I might meet a companion for the journey. He is a well-educated Javanese [Djajadiningrat], who has been in Mecca for 12 years. He has been

my most loyal informant for years, and also helped me loyally when I was in Mecca' (Koningsveld 1989: 38).

Hasan Mustapa was another Indies Muslim who attracted high praise from Snouck Hurgronje. As noted, he accompanied Snouck Hurgronje during his journey to study the Islamic schools of West and Central Java in 1889 and 1890. He collected information about these schools in an effort to design a colonial policy dealing with these centres of Islamic learning. In 1896 Snouck acknowledged that 'Hasan Mustapa accompanied me in 1889-1891 on a number of my journeys in Java. Due to his indispensable assistance, a great number of indigenous people gathered around me from whom I could gather valuable information' (Koningsveld 1989: 199).

Hasan Mustapa contributed to the Dutch cause in Aceh in a number of ways. While serving as *penghulu* between 1893 and 1896 he sent weekly letters to Snouck Hurgronje in Batavia, informing him of developments there. Of these letters, Snouck Hurgronje wrote '...these were an important way for me to form an image of changes occurring subsequent to my departure from Kota Radja' (Koningsveld 1990: L).⁴ Hasan Mustapa also advocated for the Dutch cause. He wrote at least one letter to an Acehnese leader, Teungku Moehammad Zen Bantara Paloe, in which he requested him to be loyal to the East Indies Government and to command his own people not to wage war against it.⁵ Yet another contribution was his collection of questions and answers on social, political, cultural and religious matters entitled *The Revelation of Secrets About the Reality of Aceh and Pidir*.

4 Hasan Mustapa's letters to Snouck Hurgronje are stored as Cod. Or 18097, s. 16 (Arabic Letters from Kotaraja, Correspondence with Snouck Hurgronje, 1893-1895); Cod. Or. 18097 s.9 (letters sent to Snouck Hurgronje in Weltevreden, 1893-1894); and in Cod. Or. 8952 (Arabic Letters sent by Hasan Mustafa, Hoofd-Pendhulu in Bandung to Snouck Hurgronje, 1911-1923).

5 Cod. Or. 18097 s. 9, letter dated November 13, 1894.

The Revelation of Secrets About the Reality of Aceh and Pidir
 According to Snouck Hurgronje, the book was written on Wednesday, 13 November 1894, and is bearing a date of 13 November 1894. The book is in the hands of the Republic of Indonesia. The book seems to be sent to the National Library. This book is the only one of its kind in the library. It is a very rare book and does not seem to be one of the most important. The book is the last one of its kind and are not to be done. He is a very good questioner and his book is a very good one.

The Revelation

According to its introduction, he finished writing *The Revelation* on Wednesday July 25, 1894 (Muharram 21, 1312 H). Although bearing an Arabic title, the book is in fact written in Mustapa's hand in Malay (the language that is now the national language of the Republic of Indonesia). Interestingly, I have found no further information about the publication or circulation of the book. It seems it was never printed. In all of the letters Hasan Mustapa sent to Snouck Hurgronje which are kept in the Leiden University Library, no discussion can be found concerning the publication of this book.⁶

This book is presented in a sequence of questions and answers in inelegant Malay. In all, the book's 190 pages contain 154 questions. It is difficult to read. The punctuation is not clear, and the syntax does not give much help to the reader. Some paragraphs contain only one sentence which in some cases extend for more than one page. The numbering of the questions is carelessly written, especially in the last one third of the book. The book contains scribal errors, which are marked by efforts to cross them out. Furthermore, the author does not use any systematic method in explaining the subject matter. He describes, for instance, the Acehnese people in a number of questions distributed throughout the book. So if one wants to know his reflections on the Acehnese people, one has to read questions 11, 12, 13, 7, 37, 52, 51, 53, 43 and 78. Mustapa was aware of this,

6 It is rather surprising that Hasan Mustapa did not discuss this book with Snouck Hurgronje. In his letters, which were generally sent twice a month, Hasan Mustapa informed Snouck Hurgronje about his own activities, events of Kota Radja, and his own personal experiences. Mustapa included important documents such as examples of poetry on the Acehnese war, maps, his letter attempting to persuade certain figures to be loyal to the Dutch, and other important information concerning the Acehnese war.

stating that in writing this book he merely followed his mind haphazardly. Any effort to understand the book, therefore, requires multiple readings.

Mustapa presents his motive for writing this book in questions number 69 and 82. In those two questions he explains that he wrote this book to prove that he had been in Aceh, and to help the *kompèni* 'cure' the 'disease' of the Acehnese. (The Acehnese continued to use the word *kompèni* to refer to the Dutch government even after the Netherlands East India Company had ceded its authority in the Indies to the Dutch crown). Since the book contains a description of the disease of the Acehnese, he assumes that the book will be read by the 'Great People' (the Dutch East Indies Government), as the 'doctors' who were treating the disease. According to Mustapa, the doctors could not cure the disease if they did not know the disease well.

Generally speaking, Hasan Mustapa had a bad impression of the Acehnese people.⁷ Aceh is described as a country whose people always deceive each other. According to him, one can see many examples of deceit, such as between the members of the nobility, brothers, and even between sons or daughters-in-law and their parents. Mustapa maintains that it is difficult for them to refrain from their inclination to deceive. The Acehnese share a stubborn and firm character, easily forget the goodness and the favour of others, and always refuse good advice. Once they are annoyed by others, Mustapa claims, they will be angry forever. He attributes this bad character to a low level of education and literacy. In Mustapa's vision, the reflection of the poor character of the Acehnese can be seen in the *Kompèni*, the rivals of the Acehnese people in war.

7 Mustapa expressed these opinions in questions 31, 32, 48, 51 and 53.

Mustapa
justice, as
their status

In a number
concerning
to him, two
the stubborn
Nevertheless
causing 'a
and so on
medicine

not to be
they will

Musta
the Aceh
matters
gain pop
speak ab
sahid), a
had been

His
the Sub
Arabic
loftines
the Sub
The por

8 The
9 The

CHAPTER 5

Mustapa represents the *Kompeni* as people who want to establish justice, as a powerful people who rule the country cleverly, despite their status as non-believers.⁸

In a number of passages, Hasan Mustapa puts forward his opinions concerning ways to handle and manage the Acehnese. According to him, two difficulties are encountered in dealing with Aceh: (1) the stubbornness of its nobility, and (2) the stupidity of its people. Nevertheless Mustapa regretted the continuation of the war: it was causing 'a great number of diseases, such as murder, deceit, slander and so on'. The cause was worth the application of 'a great quantity of medicines to cure those diseases' (Question 80). But the solution was not to be found easily: 'One may destroy the Acehnese people, but they will emerge again' (Question 33).

Mustapa also stressed the significance of religion in dealing with the Acehnese. He regrets the fact that in Aceh political and trade matters are often mixed with religion (Question 53). If one wanted to gain popularity and the sympathy of the Acehnese, one should first speak about the excellence of those killed in the Way of God (*mati syahid*), and one should obey the rule of the religious teachers, which had become the customary law for the Acehnese (*bukum adat*).

His account of the Sultan is noteworthy.⁹ According to Mustapa, the Sultan resides in Greater Aceh and speaks Malay and sometimes Arabic. The people trust the Sultan very much due to his spiritual loftiness and dignity. The Acehnese people take the water which the Sultan uses for washing his feet, and use it for curing the sick. The populace's love and appreciation for him is reflected in their

8 The relevant questions are 25, 53, 81.

9 The relevant questions are 11, 111, 118 and 133.

HASAN MUSTAPA

reference to him as a 'jewel' (*intan*). The loyalty of the people to the Sultan is incomparable.

He paints a less impressive picture of the other elites (*raja*). Some of the *raja* are given a salary by the *Kompeni*, and are therefore loyal to the *Kompeni* and will extinguish any rebellion against it in the area of their jurisdiction.¹⁰ Some of them are not loyal to the *Kompeni*, because the latter has not been able to restore them to their earlier glory. He attributes the *raja* with stubbornness, one of the two characteristics which make it difficult for the *Kompeni* to handle Achenese. They constantly feud with each other and most of them are violent to the people. *Rajas* make use of 'coarse' language in their daily communication.

To describe another class of elites, the *uleebalang*, Hasan Mustapa refers to the words of a minor noble who said that the heart of an *uleebalang* is like a *buah mancang* (a sort of fruit). The fruit smells good and is yellow in colour. But its interior is rotten.¹¹ Mustapa describes political conflict between the sultan and the *uleebalang*. The sultan considered the *uleebalang*'s submission and loyalty to the Dutch East Indies as a menace threatening their control of the Acehnese people, as well as an insult to their sovereignty. From the *uleebalangs*' perspective, the Acehnese kings were concerned with their own dignity, power, wealth and self-interest. In their perception, the Acehnese kings were indifferent to the people's interest.

Mustapa's advice concerning Sultan Muhammad Daud (reigned 1874-1903) reveals his strategic orientation. Hasan Mustapa suggests

10 Answers to questions concerning the *raja* are found in 21, 67, 21, 86, 88, 111.

11 Concerning the *uleebalang*, see 37 and 110.

that the Sultan Muhammad Daud was strong. Mustapa named Tuanku Muhammad Tuanku Muhammad as the influence of the Sultan's control over the peace with the Hindustani and Sumatran ancient kings and Sumatran. In an Acehnese matter of decline. As well as Tuanku Muhammad merely a Sultan used the Sultan to the Dutch East Indies to decline. In Mustapa's relationship was the Acehnese of Acehnese loyal to the

12 See 21.

CHAPTER 5

that the *Kompeni* should accept the idea of the 'goodness' of Muhammad Daud, because Acehnese loyalty to him was quite strong. Mustapa mentions a learned relative of Muhammad Daud named Tuanku Hashim (Question 121). According to Mustapa, Tuanku Hashim was a prudent and wise man who held great influence among the Acehnese. If the *Kompeni* wanted to gain control over the whole of the Acehnese people, it should make peace with Tuanku Hashim, who could speak Malay, Arabic and Hindustani (Urdu), and who was well versed in the history of ancient kings and the history of some European countries, Bombay and Sumatra (Question 145).

In another passage, Hasan Mustapa maintains that for the Acehnese, cooperation with the Dutch East Indies soldiers was a matter of shame that could cause their dignity and self-esteem to decline. According to Mustapa, the collaboration of Teuku Umar as well as Tuanku Hashim with the Dutch East Indies' soldiers was merely a strategy to gain financial aid from the *Kompeni*. In fact, they used the financial aid to support the Acehnese war.¹² Their indifference to the Dutch East Indies' soldiers sprang from their belief that the Dutch East Indies government was causing the Acehnese kingdom to decline and become disintegrated.

In Mustapa's view, the Acehnese should maintain a good relationship with the Dutch East Indies soldiers, because the *Kompeni* was their 'sultan', and was striving on behalf of the interests of the Acehnese people (Question 19). The Aceh war was the embodiment of Acehnese stubbornness, and was preventing the people from being loyal to the colonial government.

12 See answers 20, 37, 44 74 and 150

HASAN MUSTAPA

The Fatwa

Questions

64. On being asked about whether or not I see goodness amongst the *raja* (indigenous elites) in Greater Aceh.

[...]

72. What are the signs of the stupidity of the religious scholars [*ulama*] of this country?

Answers

64. One must see that the cleverest among the *raja* are those who are closest to the Dutch East (Indies) government.

[...]

72. I write here that the religious books are of course in harmony with the prevailing government. In order that readers can read my view easily, I write my answer here in Malay. First, the hadith [traditions of the Prophet] state that religion is an easy matter. Secondly, the Holy Qur'an states that it is incumbent upon Muslims to be loyal to the ruling government. Thirdly, it is stated in the *Nasa'ib al-Muluk* [Advices for the Kings] that the ruler must use a thousand methods in ruling his people. But all those ways serve two aims: the advancement of the country and the happiness of the people. Fourthly, Ibn Qayyim said that the proof of justice is embodied in the religion of God. He [God] does not establish justice in one exclusive form, and because of that, most religious people think that religious law always changes. In fact, it will not change unless people have learnt this, for then they will understand that this saying is true. Ibn Hajar in 700 H. stated that we are not allowed at all to say that the religious law changes. But we say that change in law is caused by the change in legal cases.

I have selected these questions out of the 154 in *The Revelation* because they clearly convey Mustapa's ideas about the relationship

CHAPTER 5

between the Acehnese and the Dutch East Indies government, and furthermore, answer 72 does so in an exercise of religio-legal reasoning. In other words, Mustapa was wearing his *penghulu* hat when giving these answers. None of the other questions in the book are answered in this way, and considering Mustapa was an Islamic expert writing in an environment where Islamic opinions mattered greatly, this answer deserves special attention. Basing himself on traditional texts — a passage of the hadith, a verse of the Qur'an and an opinion of the author of *Nasa'ih al-Muluk* as well as the opinions of Ibn al-Qayyim and Ibn Hajar — Mustapa gives Islamic legitimacy to the authority of the Dutch East Indies Government in Aceh, and states that it is obligatory for Muslims of Aceh to be loyal to it. He believes that as long as the *Kompeni* is concerned with the two goals recommended above, it deserves the loyalty of the Acehnese. Importantly, Mustapa's opinion would mean that those Acehnese opposing the Dutch would be committing rebellion rather than supporting a Holy War against a tyrannous oppressor.

The essence of the fatwa is that Muslims should provide prima facie support to the prevailing government, and that the proper relationship between Islam and the state may manifest and be preserved in many forms, and these forms change over time. Implicitly, a colonial government is one such acceptable form. Mustapa's fatwa needs to be read not only against the political situation outlined above, but also against the consensus of Islamic legal opinion directed to the same issues. His fatwa is a contribution to a heavily-politicised dialogue. It speaks against other texts circulating at the time which argued contrasting positions. Mustapa's contribution overlooks, for example, a number of widely known passages of the Qur'an that can

be interpreted as prohibiting Muslims from acknowledging non-believers as rulers, some of which are mentioned in the Acehese poetry concerning the war against the *Kompeni*.¹³

Furthermore, Mustapa's fatwa is at odds with similar statements from other Muslim scholars. Shaykh Muhammad Nawawi al-Bantani (1813-1897) was a scholar from the West Javanese region of Banten who lived in Mecca beside Mustapa (Snouck Hurgronje 1931: 268-273). He published his opinion concerning Holy War in his book *Nibayat al-Zayn* (Nawawi 1881). He expressed the position that the necessity of Holy War depended on two conditions. First, if a Muslim country has been occupied by infidels the obligation to wage a Holy War becomes a firm societal obligation (Arabic: *fard kifayah*). The Holy War should be declared once a year by Muslims. Second, if an enemy, an infidel for instance, invades a Muslim country, the obligation to wage a Holy War would become an individual obligation. At the time of invasion, there is an obligation on every Muslim to defend the country.

Van Koningsveld (1990a) has analysed another fatwa issued specifically for Acehese conditions by Muhammad ibn Hasab Allah al-Makki al-Shafi'i (1828-1917). This man was the Mufti of Mecca for the Shafi'i legal school during the time of the Aceh War. His fatwa addressed a number of difficult questions arising out of the Dutch occupation of Kotaraja, including the issue of the religious status of those Acehese who had surrendered to the Dutch. Did they retain any rights as Acehese Muslims? The mufti's answers included a statement that it was a grave sin to surrender one's dwelling place

13 The verses include: Al 'Imran: 28, Let not the Believers take for friends or helpers unbelievers rather than believers; Al 'Imran: 118, O ye who believe! Take not into your intimacy those outside your ranks: They do not fail to corrupt you; Al-Mumtahanah: 1, O ye who believe! Take not My enemies and yours as friends (or protectors ...).

to unbelievers, considered as rights in the place where the the honour of th

These issues for Acehese soc but to surrende collaborate with Mufti's opinion (1990a: 94) poin a role in the It did have fir pamphlet (Ones), seem to his fellow (Teungku i. waging wa they did no Concluding These opt almost ce Acehese during h opinion a reveal its Muslims

14 Snouck Adra

CHAPTER 5

to unbelievers, but nevertheless, those who did so were not to be considered as unbelievers and did not lose their property and other rights in the process. They were obliged, however, to emigrate to a place where they could perform their religion in safety and protect the honour of their women (Koningsveld 1990a: 93).

These issues were of great importance for Acehnese of the time, for Acehnese society was being divided brutally. Some had no choice but to surrender, others chose martyrdom, others still chose to collaborate with the Dutch. It was natural that such an esteemed Mufti's opinion would be sought on these issues. Van Koningsveld (1990a: 94) pointed out that Ibn Hasab Allah's fatwa probably played a role in the discussions of the various Acehnese resistance-leaders. It did have flow-on effects. Teungku Kutakarang, for example, in his pamphlet entitled *Tadhkirat Al-Rakidin* (Reminder to the Inactive Ones), seems to have relied on Hasab Allah's fatwa in his approach to his fellow-Acehnese who had surrendered to the Dutch. He (Teungku Kutakarang) urged the Acehnese people to participate in waging war, but he did not consider them as kafirs, non-believers, if they did not.¹⁴

Concluding words

These opinions, or at least the ideas underpinning them, would almost certainly have been known to Mustapa. He associated with Acehnese nationalists during his time in Mecca and (probably) also during his appointment in Kota Radja. The consensus of Islamic opinion does not support Mustapa's position. *The Revelation* does not reveal its author as a diligent and impartial source of guidance for the Muslims of Aceh. Rather, it validates Snouck Hurgronje's judgement

14 Snouck Hurgronje's summary of Kutakarang's writings may be read in Gobée and Adriaanse (1990, vol 1, pp. 109-114).

HASAN MUSTAPA

of Mustapa as a man who was free of radicalism and could be relied upon in his exercise of his *penghulu* duties. It reveals Mustapa as a person whose loyalty to his brilliant Dutch colleague outweighed his commitment to Islamic legal thinking.

This loyalty had political effects. Mustapa's book stands as an attempt to induce the Acehnese people to quit their rebellion against the Dutch East Indies government, and to assure them that the colonial government was their legitimate ruler which deserved their loyalty and obedience. It may have been intended to have the same propaganda effect for Muslims in other parts of the Indies. The Dutch knew that the successful establishment of civil government in Aceh after 1881, which consequently changed the status of Acehnese resistance from waging war to a rebellion, required legitimacy in the eyes of the people. Mustapa's intervention argues that religious duty required the Acehnese to quit their rebellion against Dutch rule and to be loyal to it. One might argue that this fatwa was written as propaganda rather than legal advice. And this was not the only help Mustapa gave to the Dutch in relation to the Aceh War. In effect, due to this friendship itself, one may suggest that Hasan Mustapa occupied his position as *penghulu* as an 'informant' of his friend, Snouck Hurgronje, rather than as a professional legal official. This loyalty yielded a political benefit for the Dutch colonial government.

Bibliography

- Alfian, Teuku
1987 *Perang*
Gobée, E.
1990 *Nasib*
Pemeran
Ismail, Ibm
1997 *Kiai*
Press
Koningsv
1989 *Snouck*
1990 'Peng
Penjan
Hurg
1936
1990a 'Ber
naskah
Kapte
Nawawi, M
1881 *Nibeh*
al-Dra
Pijper, G.E
1977 *Snouck*
Bril
Reid, A
1969 *Te*
...
Snouck
1931
...
Veer
1969
Mama
Cod. C
St.
Cod. C
W.
Cod. C
Cod. C
13

CHAPTER 5

Bibliography

Alfian, Teuku Ibrahim

1987 *Perang di Jalan Allah, Aceh 1873-1912*. Jakarta: Pustaka Sinar Harapan

Gobée, E. and C. Adriaanse

1990 *Nasihah-Nasihah C. Snouck Hurgronje Semasa Kapegawaiannya Kepada Pemerintah Hindia Belanda 1889-1936*. Volume 1. Jakarta: Seri Khusus INIS.

Ismail, Ibnu Qayyim

1997 *Kiai Penghulu Jawa: Peranannya di Masa Kolonial*. Jakarta: Gema Insani Press.

Koningsveld, P Sj. van

1989 *Snouck Hurgronje dan Islam*. Jakarta: Girimukti Pusaka.

1990 'Pengantar: Nasihat-Nasihat Snouck sebagai sumber sejarah zaman Penjajahan', in E. Gobée and C. Adriaanse, (eds), *Nasihah-Nasihah C. Snouck Hurgronje semasa kepegawaiannya kepada pemerintah Hindia Belanda 1889-1936*. Jakarta: Seri Khusus INIS, XI-LXXIII.

1990a 'Bererapa aspek keagamaan Perang Aceh sebagai tercermin dalam tiga naskah berbahasa Arab yang tak diterbitkan', in W.A.L. Stokhof and N.J.G. Kaptein (eds), *Beberapa Kajian Indonesia dan Islam*. Jakarta: INIS, 77-105.

Nawawi, Muhammad b. 'Umar

1881 *Nihayat al-zayn fi irshad al-mubtadi 'in bi-sbarh Qurrat al-'ayn bi-mubimmat al-Din*. Al-Qahira.

Pijper, G.E.

1977 *Studien Over de Geschiedenis van de Islam in Indonesia 1900-1950*. Leiden: Brill.

Reid, Anthony

1969 *The Contest for North Sumatra: Atjeh, the Netherlands and Britain 1858-1898*. Kuala Lumpur: University of Malaysia Press.

Snouck Hurgronje, Ch.

1931 *Mecca in the Latter Part of the Nineteenth Century*, J.H. Monahan (transl). Leiden: Brill.

Veer, Paul van 't

1969 *De Atjeh Oorlog*. Amsterdam: N.V. Uitgeverij de Arbeiderspers.

Manuscripts stored in Universiteitsbibliotheek, Leiden University

Cod. Or. 18097 s. 16, (Arabic Letters from Kota Radja, Correspondence with Snouck Hurgronje, 1893-1995).

Cod. Or. 18097 s. 9, (Letters sent by Hasan Mustapa to Snouck Hurgronje in Weltevreden, 1893-1894).

Cod. Or. 7636, (*Kashf al-Sara'ir fi Haqiqati Atjeh wa al-Fidr*).

Cod. Or. 8952, (Arabic Letters sent by Hasan Mustapa to Snouck Hurgronje, 1911-1923).

HASAN MUSTAPA ETHNICITY AND ISLAM IN INDONESIA

EDITED BY JULIAN MILLIE

This richly documented study will be appreciated by anyone interested in modern Muslim thought.


Carl W. Ernst, William R. Kenan, Jr., Distinguished Professor of Religious Studies,
The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

CONVERSATIONS about the role and value of Islamic diversity in Indonesia's Islamic public sphere are becoming more frequent and intense. For some Muslims, homogeneity is a precondition for a prosperous and pious community. For others, diversity is a resource that is necessary for creating a just society, and for preserving Indonesia's religious, political and social distinctiveness.

Indonesia's regional Islamic traditions are increasingly being cited as reference points in these conversations. Hasan Mustapa (1857–1930) was a scholar, mystic and poet who studied in Mecca for thirteen years before commencing his career as an Islamic official in the Netherlands East Indies. He wrote a number of sufistic treatises on Islamic belief and practice, mostly in the Sundanese language.

To the surprise of many, his name and writings are now being more frequently referenced in public discourse. Indonesians are becoming more interested in his work, which they interpret as a characteristically Indonesian mediation of Islamic concepts belonging to the intellectual lineage of figures such as Ibn al-'Arabi (d. 1240) and 'Abd al-Karim Al-Jili (d. 1424). Members of the Sundanese ethnic group of West Java, who currently number around forty million, have also shown renewed interest in his work as a model for nurturing a pro-diversity ethic in the province's unsettled Islamic public sphere.

Hasan Mustapa: Ethnicity and Islam in Indonesia is comprised of chapters by Sundanese scholars, alongside the editor's contributions. Some provide introductions to Mustapa's life and work, while others perform a discursive move of increasing importance in contemporary Indonesia: reaching into a regional Islamic past to make authoritative statements about the present. Together, the chapters form a timely addition to the literature on a question of growing importance: what influence should regional traditions have in contemporary Islamic societies?

 **MONASH** University
Publishing

