



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia - Account Created in ScholarOne Manuscripts

TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia

3 August 2020 at

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

21:43

Reply-To: journal@sogang.ac.kr

To: yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id

03-Aug-2020

Dear Dr. Pribadi:

Welcome to the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia - ScholarOne Manuscripts site for online submission and review.

Your account information at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/trans> is as follows:

Your user ID: yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id

For security reasons, your password is not included in the email. If you need to reset your password, please click the link below:

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/trans?URL_MASK=c8599ee756d340f297aaca22177d41de

Please note that both user name and password are case-sensitive.

Thank you for your participation.

Sincerely,

TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia

Editorial Office

Log in to Remove This Account - https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/trans?URL_MASK=5b3d1a45b4a949018eb130f01a2a2c04



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

Manuscript ID TRaNS-2020-024 - confirmation of submission

TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Reply-To: journal@sogang.ac.kr

To: yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id

3 August 2020 at
21:56

03-Aug-2020

Dear Dr. Pribadi:

Your manuscript entitled "Sekolah Islam (Islamic Schools) as Symbols of Indonesia's Urban Muslim Identity" has been successfully submitted online for consideration for publication in the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia.

Your manuscript ID is TRaNS-2020-024.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence. If there are any changes in your contact details, please log in to ScholarOne Manuscripts at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/trans> and edit your user information as appropriate.

You can view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Center after logging in to <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/trans>.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia.

Sincerely,
Editorial Office
TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

[TRaNS] Decision on your Manuscript (TRaNS-2020-024)

TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia

6 October 2020 at

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

21:47

Reply-To: journal@sogang.ac.kr

To: yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id

Cc: journal@sogang.ac.kr

06-Oct-2020

Dear Dr. Pribadi:

Manuscript ID TRaNS-2020-024 entitled "Sekolah Islam (Islamic Schools) as Symbols of Indonesia's Urban Muslim Identity" which you submitted to the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia, has been reviewed. The comments of the reviewer(s) are included at the bottom of this letter.

The reviewer(s) have recommended publication, but also suggest some revisions to your manuscript. Therefore, we invite you to respond to the reviewer(s)' comments and revise your manuscript.

To revise your manuscript, log into <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/trans> and enter your Author Center, where you will find your manuscript under "Manuscripts with Decisions." Under "Actions," click on "Create a Revision." Your manuscript number will be appended to denote a revision. You may also click this link to start your revision:

*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm.

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/trans?URL_MASK=fb4e68a83df24065afbee1f50cc80611

When submitting your revised manuscript, you will be able to respond to the comments made by the reviewer(s) in the space provided. Please use this space to document any changes you make to the original manuscript. In order to expedite the processing of the revised manuscript, please be as specific as possible in your response to the reviewer(s).

Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia, your revised manuscript should be uploaded as soon as possible. We expect to receive your revision by 04-Jan-2021.

If it is not possible for you to submit your revision by this date, please contact the Editorial Office to rearrange the due date. Otherwise we may have to consider your paper as a new submission.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia and we look forward to receiving your revision.

Sincerely,
Yoon Hwan Shin, Editor-in-Chief,
Ki-Hyun Bae, Associate Editor
TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia
journal@sogang.ac.kr

Reviewer(s)' Comments to Author:

Reviewer: 1

Comments to the Author

This is the timely topic due to the rise of urban Muslim middle-class in Indonesia as exemplified by the conspicuous Shariah-approved lifestyle, of which quality Islamic education is part. The author does make a novel contribution by linking the rise of the Muslim middle-class to its socio-political prominence, best exemplified by the Aksi 212 that saw the imprisonment of the former governor of Jakarta, Ahok.

I feel the article adequately discusses relevant literature on the particular topic. My suggestion is for the author to add examples from primary documents such as the curriculum of Sekolah Islam to further buttress his/her argument. Curriculum of Sekolah Islam can be attained from Jaringan Sekolah Islam Terpadu (JSIT), a network of hundreds of Sekolah Islam across Indonesia.

The author presents a persuasive argument overall though it can be made more salient by adding some clarification and elaboration. For example, author can put some emphasis on the specific ways Sekolah Islam indoctrinate students outside of classroom through various extracurricular activities. I also feel there has to be a short explanation on what does "integrated curriculum" or the "Islamization of knowledge" mean in Sekolah Islam. It is a topic well covered by Ismail al-Faruqi, Syed Hossein Nasr, Osman Bakar, among others. Finally, it is not clear to me why parents who send their children to Sekolah Islam are okay with sending their children to pesantren kilat, Quranic recitals taught by pesantren graduates, and also expose them traditional Islamic rituals such as panjang mulud, tahlilan, ziarah and 20 rakaat tarawih prayers. These after-school programs and traditional rituals are antithetical to Sekolah Islam's Salafist ideology, so I'm wondering if the parents are oblivious to the ideological differences or they don't subscribe to the Salafist ideology or simply see it as a way to gain a well-rounded Islamic education? It'd be good if the author can clarify this in the article.

Reviewer: 2

Comments to the Author

This paper successfully argues that Sekolah Islam (private Islamic schools under the Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC)) have become popular in Serang, a city near Jakarta in West Java, because they symbolise the new identity of recently-made, middle class, urban Muslims.

Altogether the paper presents a useful picture of the intersection of a certain, increasingly common variant of modernist Islam and education in Indonesia, and deserves to be published, but I would like to see it made richer, more nuanced and complex.

The main shortcoming of this paper is that there is no "student voice" or dissenting voices. By only interviewing parents and adult "custodians" (such as the ustadz (teachers and preachers)), the paper is prefigured to present the ideal: we only hear about why parents chose that school, what it represents to them and how those who are invested in it (the custodians) see it. I know this is what the paper aims to do, but the message is very simple and mono-vocal, and I feel that a much richer paper might have been possible if students or, say, the parents of the 'badly-behaved' neighbourhood children (p.14) who patronised other types of schools had been interviewed. Many middle class children attend well-regarded, state, non-religious schools (which still teach Religion, by law), and I would be curious to know how they regard the Sekolah Islam. I have been to Islamic schools where parents sent their children because they thought it provided a safe and moral environment, taught them Islam and protected their children from undesirable global (Western) popular culture, but some students were actually being 'badly-behaved', so the stated ideal was being undermined in practice (at least by some). This would not have detracted from the main message of the paper, but would have provided more "thick description" (it's a bit "thin": it is not until p. 9 that we start to hear about the actual schools, and that is over by p.16) and a more nuanced picture. Also, I would like to have heard more about the political affiliation or identity of parents and "custodians" – is PKS popular among this group? The author/s claim that Sekolah Islam are at the intersection of religion, politics and education, but the politics seems a bit neglected.

There are some hints that the picture is actually not so simple. The same parents who send their children to Sekolah Islam also allow them to attend night-time pengajian in the neighbourhood, pesantren kilat (lightning Islamic schools) and other activities during Ramadan where their children are exposed to non-"true Islam" practices – i.e. local community rituals, prayers and other activities that are Islamic but could be perceived as deviant by Sekolah Islam. The author/s comment that this teaches children religious tolerance and to respect religious diversity – but that same religious tolerance and diversity is not at all advocated by Sekolah Islam – in fact they would decry it. Does anyone talk about this apparent contradiction? When both parents work full-time, one wonders if the baby-sitting functions of the Sekolah Islam and the pesantren kilat are not an important part of the picture.

The paragraph that starts at the bottom of p.2, 'On the basis of the materials, I argue...' posits 'a reciprocal relationship between "local Islam" and "foreign Islam" as seen in Islamic education'. I don't see the situation as depicted in this paper as a 'reciprocal relationship' between local and foreign Islam – in fact it seems somewhat oppositional, if by 'local' the author is referencing the 'traditional' long prayers, panjang mulud and rituals referred to elsewhere. Also, the author tries to run an argument that there is 'a quest for social order' among the new middle class Muslims but I don't see that evidenced in the paper.

Minor quibbles

p.3 'Populism is an array of "political discourses and strategies that aim to rupture institutional systems by polarizing society into two antagonistic camps" (De la Torre 2019: 8); in the context of Indonesian Islam, the camps are primarily divided into traditionalists and modernists.' In the subsequent discussion of Islamic populism in Indonesia, this division is not mentioned – and should be deleted here.

p.6 'For instance, in the 1982-83 development budget, education was the largest single item (Dick 1985: 91).' This is not the best way to show the New Order success with education.

p.6 'the emergence of new administrative regions has contributed to—in addition to popular Islamism and Islamic populism—the growth of the Muslim middle class' I don't quite see that causal connection – not demonstrated.

p.7 The para beginning 'In the Indonesian context, there are Muslim modernists...' is a bit of a mess. Re-do.

p.8 'The lower numbers of the students compared to the higher numbers of Sekolah Islam show that many parents cannot afford the high school fees charged by Sekolah Islam' – Actually no, the lower numbers do not in themselves show this. You would need data on the number of students at the different levels, and the costs at each level, to show

this, and even then it might be a coincidence. You would need some verbal proof – parents actually telling you that they didn't send their teenage children to Sekolah Islam because it was too expensive.

Minor infelicities of English: this is a sample from pp.1-5. More extensive proofreading of English would be needed.

p.1 'A recent survey indicates that religion means very significant to most Indonesians.' Rewrite.

p.2 'dates fruits' Delete fruits

'secondary-levels' Delete hyphen

p.3 'influenced mostly by the nineteenth century Middle Eastern thoughts e.g. those of Muhammad Abduh and Rashid Ridha, who had been politically marginalised by the old administration' Sounds a bit odd – rephrase 'thoughts' (thinkers?)

p.4 'posses' - spelling error

- 'righteousness and terrorist cells, those that' Punctuation

- 'partisipation' – spelling error

p.5 'a new camp consisted of urban modernist Muslims working in academia, NGOs, and Muslim social organisations, appeared to advocate' - insert 'that' after 'camp'

- 'come from newly urbanised middle-class families (Hasan 2006: 219) in which many of them' -rephrase

- 'such as the Banten Province' – delete 'the'

- 'transportation infrastructure' – add comma after 'transport'

- 'Consequently, new generations of middle-class groups emerged as a result' - delete 'consequently', a new generation

- 'the strengthening of old generations of middle-class groups' – an older generation



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

Revision TRaNS-2020-024.R1 - confirmation of submission

Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>
To: journal@sogang.ac.kr

18 January 2021 at 11:36

Dear Prof. Yoon Hwan Shin and Prof. Ki-Hyun Bae,

I hope this email finds you well. I would like to ask you about the status of my manuscript entitled "Sekolah Islam (Islamic Schools) as Symbols of Indonesia's Urban Muslim Identity" with manuscript ID TRaNS-2020-024.R1. I sent the revision on 23 November 2020. Is there any update about my manuscript?

Thank you very much.

With best regards,
Yanwar Pribadi

[Quoted text hidden]

--

Dr. Yanwar Pribadi

Assistant Professor of Local History at State Islamic University (UIN) Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin Banten
Email: yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.idMy book review article in 2020: *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde* (BKI)https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/176/4/article-p583_11.xml

My article in 2020: Book chapter in 'The New Santri: Challenges to Traditional Religious Authority in Indonesia'

<https://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg/publication/2447>My book review article in 2020: *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde* (BKI)https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/176/2-3/article-p429_16.xmlMy article in 2019: *Encyclopaedia of Islam Three*, "Madura" (Brill)https://referenceworks.brillonline.com/entries/encyclopaedia-of-islam-3/madura-COM_35959My book review article in 2019: *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde* (BKI)https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/175/4/article-p602_18.xmlMy book review article in 2019: *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde* (BKI)https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/175/1/article-p129_19.xmlMy book in 2018: *Islam, State and Society in Indonesia: Local Politics in Madura* (Routledge)<https://www.routledge.com/Islam-State-and-Society-in-Indonesia-Local-Politics-in-Madura/Pribadi/p/book/9781138202542>My article in 2018: *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies*<https://www.aljamiyah.or.id/index.php/AJIS/article/view/56201/359>My book review article in 2018: *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde* (BKI)<http://booksandjournals.brillonline.com/content/journals/10.1163/22134379-17402014>My book review article in 2018: *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde* (BKI)<http://booksandjournals.brillonline.com/content/journals/10.1163/22134379-17401003>My book review article in 2016: *ASEASUK News*<http://aseasuk.org.uk/4/sites/default/files/files/ASEASUK%20Newsletter%20No.%2060.pdf>My article in 2015: *South East Asia Research*<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.5367/sear.2015.0267>My article in 2015: *Studia Islamika*<http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika/article/view/1919>

My article in 2014: Book chapter in 'Religious Diversity in Muslim-Majority States in Southeast Asia'

<https://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg/publication/2016>



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

Revision TRaNS-2020-024.R1 - confirmation of submission

TRaNS Journal <journal@sogang.ac.kr>
Reply-To: TRaNS Journal <journal@sogang.ac.kr>
To: Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

18 January 2021 at 23:11

Dear Dr. Pribadi,

Thank you for your message. Your manuscript is currently under review. It took us quite some time to secure external reviewers when it was submitted. That is why it is taking longer than average.

We are expecting to receive feedback from reviewers by the end of January. Once I receive them, the editors will make a final decision and send it to you soon.

Thank you for your patience.

Sincerely,

Ki

--- Original Message ---

From : "Yanwar Pribadi" <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

To : journal@sogang.ac.kr

Date : 2021/01/18 월요일 오후 1:36:08

Subject : Re: Revision TRaNS-2020-024.R1 - confirmation of submission

[Quoted text hidden]



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

Revision TRaNS-2020-024.R2 - confirmation of submission

TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia

29 April 2021 at

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

08:22

Reply-To: journal@sogang.ac.kr

To: yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id

28-Apr-2021

Dear Dr. Pribadi:

Your revised manuscript entitled "Sekolah Islam (Islamic Schools) as Symbols of Indonesia's Urban Muslim Identity" has been successfully submitted online for consideration for publication in the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia.

Your manuscript ID is TRaNS-2020-024.R2.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence. If there are any changes in your contact details, please log in to ScholarOne Manuscripts at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/trans> and edit your user information as appropriate.

You can view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Center after logging in to <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/trans>.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia.

Sincerely,
Editorial Office
TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

[TRaNS] Decision on your Manuscript (TRaNS-2020-024.R1)

TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Reply-To: journal@sogang.ac.kr

To: yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id

Cc: journal@sogang.ac.kr

19 February 2021 at
20:40

19-Feb-2021

Dear Dr. Pribadi:

Manuscript ID TRaNS-2020-024.R1 entitled "Sekolah Islam (Islamic Schools) as Symbols of Indonesia's Urban Muslim Identity" which you submitted to the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia, has been reviewed. The comments of the reviewer(s) are included at the bottom of this letter.

While the reviewer(s) recognise the potential of your manuscript as a valuable contribution to the journal, they also suggest some major revisions to your manuscript. Therefore, we invite you to respond to the reviewer(s)' comments and revise your manuscript. At this point, it is up to you whether you want to resubmit it and go another round of external peer review. If not, please let us know. You can withdraw your submission.

To revise your manuscript, log into <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/trans> and enter your Author Center, where you will find your manuscript under "Manuscripts with Decisions." Under "Actions," click on "Create a Revision." Your manuscript number will be appended to denote a revision. You may also click this link to start your revision:

*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm.

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/trans?URL_MASK=0d5b266af2a3441d8647b1257b32fce7

When submitting your revised manuscript, you will be able to respond to the comments made by the reviewer(s) in the space provided. Please use this space to document any changes you make to the original manuscript. In order to expedite the processing of the revised manuscript, please be as specific as possible in your response to the reviewer(s).

Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia, your revised manuscript should be uploaded as soon as possible. We expect to receive your revision by 20-May-2021.

If it is not possible for you to submit your revision by this date, please contact the Editorial Office to rearrange the due date. Otherwise we may have to consider your paper as a new submission.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia and we look forward to receiving your revision.

Sincerely,
Yoon Hwan Shin, Editor-in-Chief,
Ki-Hyun Bae, Associate Editor
TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia
journal@sogang.ac.kr

Reviewer(s)' Comments to Author:

Comments to the Author


- Indonesia is not the only country facing the rise of religious conservatism. This should lead author to look at what happens in other societies especially in Muslim societies. By doing this, I assume the author can then justify why researching on an Islamic institution, such as Sekolah Islam can help understand social transformation taking place in Muslim societies. Author should include existing literature that discuss the history of Islamic educational institution in Indonesia which is currently absent in this article. The author argues that Sekolah Islam is a product of 'foreign Islam'. What do you mean by foreign? The article mentions several times about foreign and local cultures and argues that unlike pesantren, Islamic schools are influenced by 'foreign' Islamic cultures because it is strongly influenced by salafism. Does the author think Islam is not 'foreign' to Indonesia? This is to me is a huge problem. To tackle this problem, the author should include existing literature that analyse Indonesian Islam, the history of Islamic educational

institutions. It also does not provide adequate analysis on the category of urban - middle class? In Indonesian context how would urban and middle class is defined. Since this seems to be the central point of the article, the author needs to carefully define and discuss terminologies that are used in this article; including what does it mean with urban middle class, identity politics, true Islam, foreign vs local. I have provided more comments directly into the texts. Please see attached. The article has the potential to be developed further.

- Writing is not clear. It is not well structured. Introduction needs to be restructured It does not discuss its research questions clearly.

- At this stage, the article does not contextualise its focus on Islamic schools to the global and regional development in regards to the role of Islamic education institution. It would benefit from a comparative analysis on the place of Islamic schools in other socio-cultural and political context. Then it will fit better into the scope of TRaNS.

For detailed comments, please see attached.

 **TRaNS-2020-024.R1_Proof_hi.pdf**
352K



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

[TRaNS] Decision on your Manuscript (TRaNS-2020-024.R1)

Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>
To: journal@sogang.ac.kr

21 February 2021 at 19:12

Dear Prof. Yoon Hwan Shin and Prof. Ki-Hyun Bae,

Thank you for your email.

Before taking the next step, however, I would like to ask you some questions first in order to make some things clear.

On 6 October 2020, I received an email from TRaNS indicating that my paper was reviewed by two reviewers. The reviewers recommended publication. Here is the email:

06-Oct-2020

Dear Dr. Pribadi:

Manuscript ID TRaNS-2020-024 entitled "Sekolah Islam (Islamic Schools) as Symbols of Indonesia's Urban Muslim Identity" which you submitted to the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia, has been reviewed. The comments of the reviewer(s) are included at the bottom of this letter.

The reviewer(s) have recommended publication, but also suggest some revisions to your manuscript. Therefore, we invite you to respond to the reviewer(s)' comments and revise your manuscript.

I followed all the 2 reviewers' suggestions, and therefore expected that my paper would be immediately published. However, on 19 February 2021 I received another email indicating that my paper was reviewed again, and this time the reviewer suggested a major revision. For that matter, I have some questions:

1. Is it a normal procedure at TRaNS to have 3 reviewers instead of 2 reviewers, while the first 2 reviewers already recommended publication (unless among the 2 reviewers, 1 was against publication, so that the third reviewer's comments would be sought)?
2. If I follow the third reviewer's suggestions, how many more rounds do I have to undergo before I have my paper published?
3. If I follow the third reviewer's suggestion, will it be the last?
4. If my paper is finally accepted for publication, when will it be approximately published? In 2021?

With best wishes,
Yanwar

[Quoted text hidden]

--
Dr. Yanwar Pribadi

Assistant Professor of Local History at State Islamic University (UIN) Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin Banten
Email: yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id

My book review article in 2020: *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde* (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/176/4/article-p583_11.xml

My article in 2020: Book chapter in 'The New Santri: Challenges to Traditional Religious Authority in Indonesia'

<https://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg/publication/2447>

My book review article in 2020: *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde* (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/176/2-3/article-p429_16.xml

My article in 2019: *Encyclopaedia of Islam Three*, "Madura" (Brill)

https://referenceworks.brillonline.com/entries/encyclopaedia-of-islam-3/madura-COM_35959

My book review article in 2019: *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde* (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/175/4/article-p602_18.xml

My book review article in 2019: *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde* (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/175/1/article-p129_19.xml

My book in 2018: *Islam, State and Society in Indonesia: Local Politics in Madura* (Routledge)

<https://www.routledge.com/Islam-State-and-Society-in-Indonesia-in-Indonesia-Local-Politics-in-Madura/Pribadi/p/book/9781138202542>

My article in 2018: *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies*

<https://www.aljariah.or.id/index.php/AJIS/article/view/56201/359>

My book review article in 2018: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

<http://booksandjournals.brillonline.com/content/journals/10.1163/22134379-17402014>

My book review article in 2018: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

<http://booksandjournals.brillonline.com/content/journals/10.1163/22134379-17401003>

My book review article in 2016: ASEASUK News

<http://aseasuk.org.uk/4/sites/default/files/files/ASEASUK%20Newsletter%20No.%2060.pdf>

My article in 2015: South East Asia Research

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.5367/sear.2015.0267>

My article in 2015: Studia Islamika

<http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika/article/view/1919>

My article in 2014: Book chapter in 'Religious Diversity in Muslim-Majority States in Southeast Asia'

<https://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg/publication/2016>



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

[TRaNS] Decision on your Manuscript (TRaNS-2020-024.R1)

TRaNS Journal <journal@sogang.ac.kr>
Reply-To: TRaNS Journal <journal@sogang.ac.kr>
To: Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

23 February 2021 at 21:49

Dear Dr. Pribadi,

Thank you for your inquiries. Please allow me to answer your questions as follows:

1. Is it a normal procedure at TRaNS to have 3 reviewers instead of 2 reviewers, while the first 2 reviewers already recommended publication (unless among the 2 reviewers, 1 was against publication, so that the third reviewer's comments would be sought)?

Even though reviewers recommend publications with revision, we, editors, usually want the same reviewers to go over the revision and see if the revision is publishable. However, in your submission this case, unfortunately the two original reviewers declined to read it again. Therefore, we had to send it out to other external experts on this issue to see their feedback. Also, we go through the internal review process to make a final decision. The third reviewer had some very different take on your submission and we wanted to see your responses to the feedback. You can have conversations with the reviewer and how you think the reviewer's take is not really fit into your work. If you find some of the reviewers' feedback convincing, you may want to consider taking them in the revision. Editors want to see the conversation for the final decision.

2. If I follow the third reviewer's suggestions, how many more rounds do I have to undergo before I have my paper published?

In case you want to respond to them, please send the draft and your response. Editors internally will see and ask the same reviewer to take a look at it again and listen to them. However, the reviewers' suggestions are suggestions, not final decisions. Final decisions are upon editors.

3. If I follow the third reviewer's suggestion, will it be the last?

We can decide whether we want to accept it, ask for a few more minor revisions, or reject after reading the draft.

4. If my paper is finally accepted for publication, when will it be approximately published? In 2021?

The online publication will be out when your draft is finalized. So, yes, 2021 would be possible if things go smoothly. However, due to many other manuscripts in line for the print publication. Yours can be included in print probably in 2022.

Hope these help.

Kind regards,
Ki-Hyun

--- Original Message ---

From : "Yanwar Pribadi" <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>**To :** journal@sogang.ac.kr**Date :** 2021/02/21 일요일 오후 9:12:00**Subject :** Re: [TRaNS] Decision on your Manuscript (TRaNS-2020-024.R1)

[Quoted text hidden]



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

[TRaNS] Decision on your Manuscript (TRaNS-2020-024.R1)

Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

26 February 2021 at 07:07

To: TRaNS Journal <journal@sogang.ac.kr>

Dear Prof. Ki-Hyun Bae,

Thank you for the explanation. It really helps, and I really appreciate it.

I copy paste the comments from Reviewer 1 and Reviewer 2 in order to make a comparison with those of Reviewer 3:

Reviewer 1

This is the timely topic due to the rise of urban Muslim middle-class in Indonesia as exemplified by the conspicuous Shariah-approved lifestyle, of which quality Islamic education is part. The author does make a novel contribution by linking the rise of the Muslim middle-class to its socio-political prominence, best exemplified by the Aksi 212 that saw the imprisonment of the former governor of Jakarta, Ahok.

Reviewer 2

This paper successfully argues that Sekolah Islam (private Islamic schools under the Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC)) have become popular in Serang, a city near Jakarta in West Java, because they symbolise the new identity of recently-made, middle class, urban Muslims.

Altogether the paper presents a useful picture of the intersection of a certain, increasingly common variant of modernist Islam and education in Indonesia, and deserves to be published, but I would like to see it made richer, more nuanced and complex.

It seems to me that Reviewer 3 does not see my arguments and data I presented as a whole piece of the growing trend of Islamic identity politics in Indonesia, but rather view it as a separated small puzzle fragment. With your suggestion "You can have conversations with the reviewer and how you think the reviewer's take is not really fit into your work. If you find some of the reviewers' feedback convincing, you may want to consider taking them in the revision. Editors want to see the conversation for the final decision", I will make some responses to the reviewer and have some conversations with her/him, and will certainly take her/his convincing comments in the revision.

Therefore, I will make a necessary revision and go with your time table to have a timely publication, i.e. send it by 20 May 2021.

With best wishes,

Yanwar

[Quoted text hidden]



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

[TRaNS] Decision on your Manuscript (TRaNS-2020-024.R1)

Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>
To: TRaNS Journal <journal@sogang.ac.kr>

29 April 2021 at 08:30

Dear Prof. Ki-Hyun Bae,

I have submitted a revision. I have also taken the last reviewer's valuable comments and as a result, the manuscript has now undergone a thorough modification. In addition, I have also responded to his/her comments.

With best wishes,
Yanwar

[Quoted text hidden]



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

[TRaNS] Decision on your Manuscript (TRaNS-2020-024.R2)

TRaNS Journal <journal@sogang.ac.kr>
Reply-To: TRaNS Journal <journal@sogang.ac.kr>
To: Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>
Cc: journal@sogang.ac.kr

7 June 2021 at 22:10

8-June-2021

Dear Dr. Pribadi,

It is a pleasure to accept your manuscript entitled "Sekolah Islam (Islamic Schools) as Symbols of Indonesia's Urban Muslim Identity" for publication in the TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia. We would like to accept as is.

At this point, we ask you to follow the TRaNS style requirements closely in the final version. You can send the finalized files directly to us via email.

Again, thank you for your contribution to TRaNS. We look forward to receiving the final files for production soon!

Sincerely,

Yoon Hwan Shin, Editor-in-Chief,

Ki-Hyun Bae, Associate Editor

TRaNS: Trans-Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia

journal@sogang.ac.kr



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

[TRaNS] Decision on your Manuscript (TRaNS-2020-024.R2)

Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

10 June 2021 at 13:25

To: TRaNS Journal <journal@sogang.ac.kr>

Cc: TRaNS Journal <journal@sogang.ac.kr>

Dear Prof. Yoon Hwan Shin and Prof. Ki-Hyun Bae,

Thank you for this good news.

I have now followed the TRaNS style requirements closely. Please find the attached files.

With best wishes,

Yanwar

[Quoted text hidden]

--

Dr. Yanwar Pribadi

Assistant Professor of Local History at State Islamic University (UIN) Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin Banten

Email: yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id

My book review article in 2021: South East Asia Research

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/0967828X.2021.1932914>

My book review article in 2020: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/176/4/article-p583_11.xml

My article in 2020: Book chapter in 'The New Santri: Challenges to Traditional Religious Authority in Indonesia'

<https://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg/publication/2447>

My book review article in 2020: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/176/2-3/article-p429_16.xml

My article in 2019: Encyclopaedia of Islam Three, "Madura" (Brill)

https://referenceworks.brillonline.com/entries/encyclopaedia-of-islam-3/madura-COM_35959

My book review article in 2019: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/175/4/article-p602_18.xml

My book review article in 2019: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/175/1/article-p129_19.xml

My book in 2018: Islam, State and Society in Indonesia: Local Politics in Madura (Routledge)

<https://www.routledge.com/Islam-State-and-Society-in-Indonesia-Local-Politics-in-Madura/Pribadi/p/book/9781138202542>

My article in 2018: Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies

<https://www.aljami'ah.or.id/index.php/AJIS/article/view/56201/359>

My book review article in 2018: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

<http://booksandjournals.brillonline.com/content/journals/10.1163/22134379-17402014>

My book review article in 2018: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

<http://booksandjournals.brillonline.com/content/journals/10.1163/22134379-17401003>

My book review article in 2016: ASEASUK News

<http://aseasuk.org.uk/4/sites/default/files/files/ASEASUK%20Newsletter%20No.%2060.pdf>

My article in 2015: South East Asia Research

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.5367/sear.2015.0267>

My article in 2015: Studia Islamika

<http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika/article/view/1919>

My article in 2014: Book chapter in 'Religious Diversity in Muslim-Majority States in Southeast Asia'

<https://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg/publication/2016>

2 attachments**Title Page.docx**

15K

**Main Document.docx**

89K



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

TRN2100015_PRJ - Yanwar Pribadi

Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

29 July 2021 at 10:32

To: cambridgeproduction@novatechset.com, trnproduction@cambridge.org

Dear Ms. Kayla Riddleberger,

I am Yanwar Pribadi. The code of my article is TRN2100015_PRJ. The title of my article is 'Sekolah Islam (Islamic Schools) as Symbols of Indonesia's Urban Muslim Identity'. The journal is TRaNS: Trans -Regional and -National Studies of Southeast Asia.

You sent me the PDF proof on 15 July 2021 and I responded to it on 16 July 2021 to the editor of TRaNS. However, I have not heard about it until today. So, I am wondering about the status of the article.

I have read the PDF proof and I would like to confirm that my surname and my full name is correct as appears in the PDF proof (attached). I would also like to confirm that there is no error/change to be made in the article.

However, I don't see my affiliation and email address in the PDF proof of my article.

Here is my affiliation: UIN Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin Banten, Indonesia

Email: yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id

With best wishes,
Yanwar

--
Dr. Yanwar Pribadi

Assistant Professor of Local History at State Islamic University (UIN) Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin Banten

Email: yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id

My book review article in 2021: South East Asia Research

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/0967828X.2021.1932914>

My book review article in 2020: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/176/4/article-p583_11.xml

My article in 2020: Book chapter in 'The New Santri: Challenges to Traditional Religious Authority in Indonesia'

<https://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg/publication/2447>

My book review article in 2020: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/176/2-3/article-p429_16.xml

My article in 2019: Encyclopaedia of Islam Three, "Madura" (Brill)

https://referenceworks.brillonline.com/entries/encyclopaedia-of-islam-3/madura-COM_35959

My book review article in 2019: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/175/4/article-p602_18.xml

My book review article in 2019: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

https://brill.com/view/journals/bki/175/1/article-p129_19.xml

My book in 2018: Islam, State and Society in Indonesia: Local Politics in Madura (Routledge)

<https://www.routledge.com/Islam-State-and-Society-in-Indonesia-Local-Politics-in-Madura/Pribadi/p/book/9781138202542>

My article in 2018: Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies

<https://www.aljamiah.or.id/index.php/AJIS/article/view/56201/359>

My book review article in 2018: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

<http://booksandjournals.brillonline.com/content/journals/10.1163/22134379-17402014>

My book review article in 2018: Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde (BKI)

<http://booksandjournals.brillonline.com/content/journals/10.1163/22134379-17401003>

My book review article in 2016: ASEASUK News

<http://aseasuk.org.uk/4/sites/default/files/files/ASEASUK%20Newsletter%20No.%2060.pdf>

My article in 2015: South East Asia Research

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.5367/sear.2015.0267>

My article in 2015: Studia Islamika


<http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika/article/view/1919>

My article in 2014: Book chapter in 'Religious Diversity in Muslim-Majority States in Southeast Asia'

<https://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg/publication/2016>

7/8/22, 11:50 AM

UIN Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin Banten Mail - TRN2100015_PRF - Yanwar Pribadi

 **TRN2100015_PRF.pdf**
331K



Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

TRN2100015_PRF - Yanwar Pribadi

TRN Production <trnproduction@cambridge.org>
To: Yanwar Pribadi <yanwar.pribadi@uinbanten.ac.id>

10 August 2021 at 00:05

Dear Dr. Pribadi,

Your article published on July 29. Here is the link to it: <https://doi.org/10.1017/trn.2021.15>

You should have received an author access email, which contains instructions for how to access your article. Please let me know if you need me to resend the email.

Best,

Kayla

[Quoted text hidden]

Cambridge University Press & Assessment is the publishing and assessment department of the University of Cambridge. The corporate title of the University is The Chancellor, Masters, and Scholars of the University of Cambridge, but you may know us simply as 'Cambridge'. Our principal office is at Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 8EA, United Kingdom, with registered VAT number GB 823 8476 09. We are a not-for-profit organisation and an exempt charity under the Charities Act 2011.

Disclaimer

This email is intended solely for the recipient and may contain confidential information. If you have received this email in error, please let us know and then delete the original email and any attachments. Do not use, copy or disclose the contents of this email or any attachment. Any views or opinions in this email are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of Cambridge, unless specifically stated.